

ID	No Action	Proposed Action	Alternative B	My Comment/ Recommendation
A07	No snowmobiling is permitted through occupied mountain goat winter range as mapped by the Forest Service (maps and information will be shared with outfitter and guides).	Limit new guided over snow vehicle use to designated routes and specifically identified open areas, as shown on Outfitter and Guide OSV Operating Area Map.	Same as Proposed Action.	I recommend the "Proposed Action" alternative to A07, however there are no designated routes listed on the OSV map, only zones. The zones should match what the public are able to utilize. If snowmobiling is being closed to protect winter wildlife habitat, it should be CLOSED to ALL USERS, not just Outfitters.
A09	Snowplowing is not authorized.	Authorize snow removal or snowplowing on a case-by-case basis and only to address an issue such as parking congestion and competition.	Same as Proposed Action.	I recommend the "Proposed Action" alternative to A09, but snowplowing should be done throughout Nov. 1-May 1 timeframe.
A10	No direction.	Authorize no new or additional use or activities in the mapped "Areas of Concern" to lessen negative impacts to wolverine and mountain goats during winter/spring. Dec. 1 - June 30. See map for details.	Same as Proposed Action however, Alt B allows for opportunities in the Sawtooth Wz, as a result a new "Area of Concern". See map for details.	I recommend the "No Action" alternative to A10. If these species are being threatened by activity then we shouldn't be allowed to hunt them.
A12	In the Sawtooth Wilderness) Permit no new additional Outfitter and Guide permits.	Authorize no additional priority use in the Sawtooth Wilderness or on trails that access the Sawtooth Wilderness	Authorize new or additional priority use in the Sawtooth Wilderness or on trails that access the Sawtooth Wilderness, only if the proposed use will meet wilderness management goals and guidelines described in the wilderness and forest plans; solitude and recreation site monitoring is up to-date, and monitoring data confirms that established thresholds are being met.	I recommend the "No Action" alternative to A12 as the Outfitters have no control of the Forest Service being able to keep monitoring up to date. The Outfitters requests for additional days shouldn't be restricted by the Forest Service being unable to track these numbers based on a budget or priorities. This element classifies the Sawtooth Wilderness Huts as "wilderness use," which is significantly inaccurate.
A16	No direction.	Prohibit guided climbing in peregrine falcon nesting areas during breeding season. April 1 - July 15	Same as Proposed Action.	I recommend the "No Action" alternative to A16. There is no indication on how far this closure will be given from a nesting site. If the language was more clear in this direction, I would be more inclined for protection of this species which studies have shown are INCREASING in population.
A18	No direction.	Within the Wood River, Sawtooth East, and Salmon Headwaters/Sawtooth Valley Geographic Compartments; require an approved parking or shuttle service plan for proposals that would increase service days and/or offer new opportunities in winter. Nov. 1 to May 1	Sames as Proposed Action.	I recommend the "No Action" alternative to A18. The Proposed Action limits increased service in these regions and puts an increased financial burden on Outfitters with needing to provide a shuttle service. There is increased use at Redfish due to the Forest Service allowing winter use to the Redfish Cabin rentals, why should the hut system be held responsible for this increased allowed use?
A19	No direction.	Limit the amount of guided winter use on the Galena Pass to historical levels (1,800 service days). Allow no more than 1 avalanche class per outfitter per weekend day or holiday. Allow no more than 3 guided groups per outfitter per weekend day or holiday. Nov. 1 to May 1	Same as Proposed Action.	I strongly recommend "No Action" to A19. There has been no measurement of public recreation in the Galena Pass area. Therefore, the carrying capacity cannot be measured between outfitted public and public recreation. Public comments have expressed 78% (88 comments) of users had no concerns about the current amount of guided use.
A26	(In the Sawtooth Wilderness) Temporary increases in use will be evaluated to determine need and impacts to wilderness.	Do not authorize short-term priority use in any of the three wilderness areas. (i.e., no days may be drawn from the pool for this purpose)	Limit short-term priority use in wilderness to 200 service days per season (i.e., no more than 200 days may be drawn from the pool per season).	I recommend that the "Alternative B" be changed for A26 or reverted to its "No Action" framing. 200 days is an arbitrary number which isn't tied to any monitoring or data. This will basically cap all guided use to current use in all wilderness areas. It will be impossible to qualify for any significant additional long term priority use days.
1	There is no group size direction identified in the Forest Plan specific to outfitting and guiding however, the Forest Plan specifies a general group size limit of 12 persons for all three wilderness areas on the Sawtooth NRA. The Authorized Officer may consider exceptions to the group size limit for commercial services in any of the three wilderness areas. This exception would be rare and may not exceed a group size limit of 20 and must be authorized in the permit.	A group size limit of 12 persons total will apply to all commercial activities, year round. The Authorized Officer may consider exceptions to the group size limit for commercial services anywhere on the Sawtooth NRA. This exception would be rare and may not exceed a group size limit of 20 and must be authorized in the permit.	Same as Proposed Action.	I recommend the "No Action" alternative to 001. The current Wilderness Regulations are adequate, setting groups to 12 people in one group in the Wilderness. This group size limit is below the bed capacity at the huts and below the historic use levels at the huts. Such limits will create less access to existing huts.